medicinewithmorality.org.au

Australian Doctors concerned with the drift of ethics away from moral absolutes



lachlan@medicinewithmorality.org.au PO Box 68 Morley WA 6943

13 April 2007

Parliament House East Melbourne Victoria 3002

Creation of human life for destruction is a boundary we must not cross. Medicine With Morality urges you not to support human cloning.

An SCNT clone with human chromosomes is embryonic human life.

It is with dismay and incredulity that we still hear statements about the human embryo and SCNT clones that have been refuted long ago – even by pro-cloning scientists.

A cloned embryo with human chromosomes that is formed by SCNT – \mathbf{T} ransferring a body cell (i.e. a **S**omatic **C**ell e.g. skin) to replace the **N**ucleus of a human egg – and stimulated to divide and develop into adult tissues and organs has all the genetic information needed to drive its own development and special identity as a fully grown adult provided it is given the opportunity for implantation. It *is* already a unique *human* entity, though not yet adult.

The evidence for this scientific process is obvious to all and it is Dolly the sheep.

To deny that the SCNT clone is actually an embryo is to deny Dolly the sheep. It is to deny the reality of the years of scientific research that has gone into this technique. The reason why we call embryonic stem cells *embryonic* is because they are from embryos.

To deny that such a cloned embryo with a full genetic complement of human chromosomes is actually human is nonsense. We may argue about personhood but we may not dispute that this is human life. A cloned human embryo formed by SCNT is as much an embryo as that formed by IVF – Assisted Reproductive Technology (ART). It is human life even when it is not intended to be born'.

It is not true, as some have argued, that federal legislation has made human cloning illegal. What has been made illegal is implantation of the human clone and therefore to have the chance of independent existence.

We, the doctors of *Medicine With Morality*, want to clearly state that there should be no confusion. An SCNT embryo with human chromosomes is human life and all human life matters.

Please do not be swayed by the promise that embryonic stem cells (ESCs) have greater potential than those from non-embryonic sources. The evidence is in – the runs are on the board – non-ESCs have proven and safe benefits without the destruction of human life. ESCs, because of their pluri-potentiality, can have dangerous effects e.g. tumour formation. Non-ESCs can now be 'tweaked' to behave more like ESCs anyway so it is just simply not necessary to destroy human life. The deliberate creation of human life for destruction is a boundary that we must not cross.

Please do not be swayed by the argument that we will lose research scientists. If we were to simply follow the medical ethics of other countries in order to retain scientists we would always be forced to the lowest common (ethical) denominator.

There are already prominent voices challenging boundaries. Four years ago when we made the decision to experiment on and kill embryos that were left over from IVF it was said that we would never actually specifically create embryos for this purpose and that this would not be morally permissible, and now we have exactly that in the federal legislation. Even now there are voices calling for the use of later stage embryos with formed organs. Even now in UK the use of human female eggs has "progressed" to having commercial value.

And once we start considering whether we can sacrifice one human life for another of greater potential we have crossed another significant boundary that has frightening consequences. The dependent and vulnerable must be protected at all stages of existence otherwise we open the door to the discarding of human life depending on the value we attach to it. In the advancement of medicine this is something we must not ever contemplate.

We cannot afford to devalue human life at any point and we plead with you not to give legal approval for such devaluation.

Dr Lachlan Dunjey MBBS FRACGP DObstRCOG (contact person) 33 Bunya St Dianella WA 6059 mob 0407 937 513

(signatories follow)